# Set Theory and the Continuum Problem

Raymond M. Smullyan
*Indiana University*

and

Melvin Fitting
*City University of New York*

CLARENDON PRESS · OXFORD
1996

# CONTENTS

## I AXIOMATIC SET THEORY


| | | |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | **General background** | 3 |
| §1 | What is infinity? | 3 |
| §2 | Countable or uncountable? | 4 |
| §3 | A non-denumerable set | 6 |
| §4 | Larger and smaller | 7 |
| §5 | The continuum problem | 8 |
| §6 | Significance of the results | 9 |
| §7 | Frege set theory | 10 |
| §8 | Russell's paradox | 11 |
| §9 | Zermelo set theory | 12 |
| §10 | Sets and classes | 13 |
| 2 | **Some basics of class-set theory** | 14 |
| §1 | Extensionality and separation | 14 |
| §2 | Transitivity and supercompleteness | 16 |
| §3 | Axiom of the empty set | 17 |
| §4 | The pairing axiom | 18 |
| §5 | The union axiom | 20 |
| §6 | The power axiom | 22 |
| §7 | Cartesian products | 22 |
| §8 | Relations | 23 |
| §9 | Functions | 23 |
| §10 | Some useful facts about transitivity | 24 |
| §11 | Basic universes | 25 |
| 3 | **The natural numbers** | 27 |
| §1 | Preliminaries | 27 |
| §2 | Definition of the natural numbers | 29 |
| §3 | Derivation of the Peano postulates and other results | 31 |
| §4 | A double induction principle and its applications | 32 |
| §5 | Applications to natural numbers | 37 |
| §6 | Finite sets | 39 |
| §7 | Denumerable classes | 39 |
| §8 | Definition by finite recursion | 40 |
| §9 | Supplement—optional | 41 |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| **4** | **Superinduction, well ordering and choice** | 43 |
| §1 | Introduction to well ordering | 43 |
| §2 | Superinduction and double superinduction | 48 |
| §3 | The well ordering of $g$-towers | 51 |
| §4 | Well ordering and choice | 52 |
| §5 | Maximal principles | 55 |
| §6 | Another approach to maximal principles | 58 |
| §7 | Cowen's theorem | 60 |
| §8 | Another characterization of $g$-sets | 62 |
| **5** | **Ordinal numbers** | 64 |
| §1 | Ordinal numbers | 64 |
| §2 | Ordinals and transitivity | 67 |
| §3 | Some ordinals | 69 |
| **6** | **Order isomorphism and transfinite recursion** | 70 |
| §1 | A few preliminaries | 70 |
| §2 | Isomorphisms of well orderings | 71 |
| §3 | The axiom of substitution | 73 |
| §4 | The counting theorem | 74 |
| §5 | Transfinite recursion theorems | 74 |
| §6 | Ordinal arithmetic | 78 |
| **7** | **Rank** | 81 |
| §1 | The notion of rank | 81 |
| §2 | Ordinal hierarchies | 82 |
| §3 | Applications to the $R_\alpha$'s | 83 |
| §4 | Zermelo universes | 85 |
| **8** | **Foundation, $\in$-induction, and rank** | 88 |
| §1 | The notion of well-foundedness | 88 |
| §2 | Descending $\in$-chains | 89 |
| §3 | $\in$-Induction and rank | 90 |
| §4 | Axiom $E$ and Von Neumann's principle | 91 |
| §5 | Some other characterizations of ordinals | 93 |
| §6 | More on the axiom of substitution | 94 |
| **9** | **Cardinals** | 96 |
| §1 | Some simple facts | 96 |
| §2 | The Bernstein-Schröder theorem | 97 |
| §3 | Denumerable sets | 99 |
| §4 | Infinite sets and choice functions | 100 |
| §5 | Hartog's theorem | 101 |
| §6 | A fundamental theorem | 102 |
| §7 | Preliminaries | 104 |
| §8 | Cardinal arithmetic | 106 |

§9 Sierpiński's theorem 109

## II CONSISTENCY OF THE CONTINUUM HYPOTHESIS

**10 Mostowski-Shepherdson mappings** 115
§1 Relational systems 115
§2 Generalized induction and Γ-rank 117
§3 Generalized transfinite recursion 120
§4 Mostowski-Shepherdson maps 122
§5 More on Mostowski-Shepherdson mappings 123
§6 Isomorphisms, Mostowski-Shepherdson maps, and well orderings 124

**11 Reflection principles** 128
§0 Preliminaries 128
§1 The Tarski-Vaught theorem 131
§2 We add extensionality considerations 133
§3 The class version of the Tarski-Vaught theorems 134
§4 Mostowski, Shepherdson, Tarski, and Vaught 137
§5 The Montague-Levy reflection theorem 137

**12 Constructible sets** 141
§0 More on first-order definability 141
§1 The class $L$ of constructible sets 142
§2 Absoluteness 143
§3 Constructible classes 148

**13 $L$ is a well founded first-order universe** 153
§1 First-order universes 153
§2 Some preliminary theorems about first-order universes 156
§3 More on first-order universes 157
§4 Another result 160

**14 Constructibility is absolute over $L$** 162
§1 Σ-formulas and upward absoluteness 162
§2 More on Σ definability 164
§3 The relation $y = \mathcal{F}(x)$ 166
§4 Constructibility is absolute over $L$ 171
§5 Further results 172
§6 A proof that $L$ can be well ordered 173

**15 Constructibility and the continuum hypothesis** 176
§0 What we will do 176
§1 The key result 177
§2 Gödel's isomorphism theorem (optional) 179

§3 Some consequences of Theorem G 181
§4 Metamathematical consequences of Theorem G 181
§5 Relative consistency of the axiom of choice 183
§6 Relative consistency of GCH and AC in class-set theory 183

## III FORCING AND INDEPENDENCE RESULTS

**16 Forcing, the very idea** 189
§1 What is forcing? 189
§2 What is modal logic? 191
§3 What is *S*4 and why do we care? 195
§4 A classical embedding 196
§5 The basic idea 202

**17 The construction of *S*4 models for *ZF*** 203
§1 What are the models? 203
§2 About equality 208
§3 The well founded sets are present 212
§4 Four more axioms 214
§5 The definability of forcing 218
§6 The substitution axiom schema 220
§7 The axiom of choice 222
§8 Where we stand now 225

**18 The axiom of constructibility is independent** 226
§1 Introduction 226
§2 Ordinals are well behaved 226
§3 Constructible sets are well behaved too 228
§4 A real *S*4 model, at last 229
§5 Cardinals are sometimes well behaved 230
§6 The status of the generalized continuum hypothesis 233

**19 Independence of the continuum hypothesis** 235
§1 Power politics 235
§2 The model 235
§3 Cardinals stay cardinals 236
§4 CH is independent 238
§5 Cleaning it up 239
§6 Wrapping it up 241

**20 Independence of the axiom of choice** 243
§1 A little history 243
§2 Automorphism groups 243
§3 Automorphisms preserve truth 246
§4 Model and submodel 248

§5 Verifying the axioms 249
§6 AC is independent 254

**21 Constructing classical models** 259
§1 On countable models 259
§2 Cohen's way 260
§3 Dense sets, filters, and generic sets 261
§4 When generic sets exist 263
§5 Generic extensions 264
§6 The truth lemma 267
§7 Conclusion 269

**22 Forcing background** 271
§1 Introduction 271
§2 Cohen's version(s) 272
§3 Boolean valued models 273
§4 Unramified forcing 273
§5 Extensions 274

**References** 277

**Subject index** 281

**Notation index** 287