The Bounds of Reason Game Theory and the Unification of the Behavioral Sciences

Herbert Gintis

Princeton University Press Princeton and Oxford Copyright ©2009 by Princeton University Press

Published by Princeton University Press, 41 William Street, Princeton, New Jersey 08540 In the United Kingdom: Princeton University Press, 6 Oxford Street, Woodstock, Oxfordshire OX20 1TW

All Rights Reserved

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Gintis, Herbert

The Bounds of Reason: Game Theory and the Unification of the Behavioral Sciences / Herbert Gintis

p. cm.

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-0-691-14052-0 (hardcover: alk. paper) 1. Game theory. 2. Practical reason.

3. Human behavior. 4. Social sciences–Methodology. 5. Psychology. I. Title. HB144.G552009

519.3-dc22

2008036522

British Library Cataloging-in-Publication Data is available

The publisher would like to acknowledge the author of this volume for providing the

camera-ready copy from which this book was printed

This book has been composed in Times and Mathtime by the author

Printed on acid-free paper.

press.princeton.edu

Printed in the United States of America

10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

Contents

| Preface | | | xiii |
|---------|----------|---|------|
| 1 | Decision | n Theory and Human Behavior | 1 |
| | 1.1 | Beliefs, Preferences, and Constraints | 4 |
| | 1.2 | The Meaning of Rational Action | 6 |
| | 1.3 | Why Are Preferences Consistent? | 7 |
| | 1.4 | Time Inconsistency | 8 |
| | 1.5 | Bayesian Rationality and Subjective Priors | 11 |
| | 1.6 | The Biological Basis for Expected Utility | 16 |
| | 1.7 | The Allais and Ellsberg Paradoxes | 16 |
| | 1.8 | Risk and the Shape of the Utility Function | 18 |
| | 1.9 | Prospect Theory | 21 |
| | 1.10 | Heuristics and Biases in Decision Making | 26 |
| 2 | Game T | heory: Basic Concepts | 30 |
| | 2.1 | The Extensive Form | 30 |
| | 2.2 | The Normal Form | 33 |
| | 2.3 | Mixed Strategies | 34 |
| | 2.4 | Nash Equilibrium | 35 |
| | 2.5 | The Fundamental Theorem of Game Theory | 36 |
| | 2.6 | Solving for Mixed-Strategy Nash Equilibria | 37 |
| | 2.7 | Throwing Fingers | 38 |
| | 2.8 | The Battle of the Sexes | 38 |
| | 2.9 | The Hawk-Dove Game | 39 |
| | 2.10 | The Prisoner's Dilemma | 40 |
| | 2.11 | Alice, Bob, and the Choreographer | 41 |
| | 2.12 | An Efficiency-Enhancing Choreographer | 43 |
| | 2.13 | The Correlated Equilibrium Solution Concept | 44 |
| 3 | Game T | Theory and Human Behavior | 45 |
| | 3.1 | Self- and Other-Regarding Preferences | 46 |

| 3.3An Anonymous Market Exchange53.4The Rationality of Altruistic Giving53.5Conditional Altruistic Cooperation53.6Altruistic Punishment53.7Strong Reciprocity in the Labor Market53.8Altruistic Third-Party Punishment63.9Altruism and Cooperation in Groups63.10Inequality Aversion63.11The Trust Game73.12Character Virtues73.13The Situational Character of Preferences73.14The Dark Side of Altruistic Cooperation73.15Norms of Cooperation: Cross-Cultural Variation74Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality84.1Epistemic Game84.2A Simple Epistemic Game84.3An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes84.4Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies84.5Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies84.6Rationalizable Strategies94.7Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies94.8Common Knowledge of Rationality94.9Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality9 |
|---|
| 3.4The Rationality of Altruistic Giving53.5Conditional Altruistic Cooperation53.6Altruistic Punishment53.7Strong Reciprocity in the Labor Market53.8Altruistic Third-Party Punishment63.9Altruism and Cooperation in Groups63.10Inequality Aversion63.11The Trust Game73.12Character Virtues73.13The Situational Character of Preferences73.14The Dark Side of Altruistic Cooperation73.15Norms of Cooperation: Cross-Cultural Variation74Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality84.1Epistemic Games84.2A Simple Epistemic Game84.3An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes84.4Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies84.5Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies84.6Rationalizable Strategies94.7Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies94.8Common Knowledge of Rationality94.9Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality9 |
| 3.6Altruistic Punishment53.7Strong Reciprocity in the Labor Market53.8Altruistic Third-Party Punishment63.9Altruism and Cooperation in Groups63.10Inequality Aversion63.11The Trust Game73.12Character Virtues73.13The Situational Character of Preferences73.14The Dark Side of Altruistic Cooperation73.15Norms of Cooperation: Cross-Cultural Variation74Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality84.1Epistemic Games84.2A Simple Epistemic Game84.3An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes84.4Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies84.5Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies84.6Rationalizable Strategies94.7Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies94.8Common Knowledge of Rationality94.9Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality9 |
| 3.7Strong Reciprocity in the Labor Market53.8Altruistic Third-Party Punishment63.9Altruism and Cooperation in Groups63.10Inequality Aversion63.11The Trust Game73.12Character Virtues73.13The Situational Character of Preferences73.14The Dark Side of Altruistic Cooperation73.15Norms of Cooperation: Cross-Cultural Variation74Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality84.1Epistemic Games84.2A Simple Epistemic Game84.3An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes84.4Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies84.5Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies84.6Rationalizable Strategies94.7Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies94.8Common Knowledge of Rationality94.9Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality9 |
| 3.8Altruistic Third-Party Punishment63.9Altruism and Cooperation in Groups63.10Inequality Aversion63.11The Trust Game73.12Character Virtues73.13The Situational Character of Preferences73.14The Dark Side of Altruistic Cooperation73.15Norms of Cooperation: Cross-Cultural Variation74Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality84.1Epistemic Games84.2A Simple Epistemic Game84.3An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes84.4Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies84.5Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies84.6Rationalizable Strategies94.7Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies94.8Common Knowledge of Rationality94.9Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality9 |
| 3.9Altruism and Cooperation in Groups63.10Inequality Aversion63.11The Trust Game73.12Character Virtues73.13The Situational Character of Preferences73.14The Dark Side of Altruistic Cooperation73.15Norms of Cooperation: Cross-Cultural Variation74Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality84.1Epistemic Games84.2A Simple Epistemic Game84.3An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes84.4Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies84.5Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies84.6Rationalizable Strategies94.7Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies94.8Common Knowledge of Rationality94.9Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality9 |
| 3.10Inequality Aversion63.11The Trust Game73.12Character Virtues73.13The Situational Character of Preferences73.14The Dark Side of Altruistic Cooperation73.15Norms of Cooperation: Cross-Cultural Variation74Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality84.1Epistemic Games84.2A Simple Epistemic Game84.3An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes84.4Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies84.5Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies84.6Rationalizable Strategies94.7Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies94.8Common Knowledge of Rationality94.9Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality9 |
| 3.11The Trust Game73.12Character Virtues73.13The Situational Character of Preferences73.14The Dark Side of Altruistic Cooperation73.15Norms of Cooperation: Cross-Cultural Variation74Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality84.1Epistemic Games84.2A Simple Epistemic Game84.3An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes84.4Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies84.5Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies84.6Rationalizable Strategies94.7Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies94.8Common Knowledge of Rationality94.9Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality9 |
| 3.12 Character Virtues 3.13 The Situational Character of Preferences 3.14 The Dark Side of Altruistic Cooperation 3.15 Norms of Cooperation: Cross-Cultural Variation 4 Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality 4.1 Epistemic Games 4.2 A Simple Epistemic Game 4.3 An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes 4.4 Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies 4.5 Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies 4.6 Rationalizable Strategies 4.7 Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies 4.8 Common Knowledge of Rationality 9 4.9 Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality |
| 3.13The Situational Character of Preferences73.14The Dark Side of Altruistic Cooperation73.15Norms of Cooperation: Cross-Cultural Variation74Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality84.1Epistemic Games84.2A Simple Epistemic Game84.3An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes84.4Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies84.5Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies84.6Rationalizable Strategies94.7Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies94.8Common Knowledge of Rationality94.9Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality9 |
| 3.14The Dark Side of Altruistic Cooperation73.15Norms of Cooperation: Cross-Cultural Variation74Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality84.1Epistemic Games84.2A Simple Epistemic Game84.3An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes84.4Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies84.5Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies84.6Rationalizable Strategies94.7Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies94.8Common Knowledge of Rationality94.9Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality9 |
| 3.15Norms of Cooperation: Cross-Cultural Variation74Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality84.1Epistemic Games84.2A Simple Epistemic Game84.3An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes84.4Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies84.5Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies84.6Rationalizable Strategies94.7Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies94.8Common Knowledge of Rationality94.9Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality9 |
| 4Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality84.1Epistemic Games84.2A Simple Epistemic Game84.3An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes84.4Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies84.5Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies84.6Rationalizable Strategies94.7Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies94.8Common Knowledge of Rationality94.9Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality9 |
| 4.1Epistemic Games84.2A Simple Epistemic Game84.3An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes84.4Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies84.5Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies84.6Rationalizable Strategies94.7Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies94.8Common Knowledge of Rationality94.9Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality9 |
| 4.2 A Simple Epistemic Game 4.3 An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes 4.4 Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies 4.5 Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies 4.6 Rationalizable Strategies 4.7 Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies 4.8 Common Knowledge of Rationality 4.9 Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality |
| 4.2 A Simple Epistemic Game 4.3 An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes 4.4 Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies 4.5 Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies 4.6 Rationalizable Strategies 4.7 Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies 4.8 Common Knowledge of Rationality 4.9 Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality |
| 4.3 An Epistemic Battle of the Sexes 4.4 Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies 4.5 Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies 4.6 Rationalizable Strategies 4.7 Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies 4.8 Common Knowledge of Rationality 4.9 Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality |
| 4.4 Dominated and Iteratedly Dominated Strategies 4.5 Eliminating Weakly Dominated Strategies 4.6 Rationalizable Strategies 4.7 Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies 4.8 Common Knowledge of Rationality 4.9 Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality |
| 4.6 Rationalizable Strategies 4.7 Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies 4.8 Common Knowledge of Rationality 4.9 Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality |
| 4.6 Rationalizable Strategies 4.7 Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies 4.8 Common Knowledge of Rationality 4.9 Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality |
| 4.7 Eliminating Strongly Dominated Strategies 4.8 Common Knowledge of Rationality 4.9 Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality |
| 4.8 Common Knowledge of Rationality 4.9 Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality 9 |
| 4.9 Rationalizability and Common Knowledge of Rationality 9 |
| |
| |
| 4.11 The Traveler's Dilemma 9 |
| 4.12 The Modified Traveler's Dilemma 9 |
| 4.13 Global Games 9 |
| 4.14 CKR Is an Event, Not a Premise 10 |
| 5 Extensive Form Rationalizability 10 |
| 5.1 Backward Induction and Dominated Strategies 10 |
| 5.2 Subgame Perfection 10 |
| 5.3 Subgame Perfection and Incredible Threats 10 |
| 5.4 The Surprise Examination 10 |
| 5.5 The Common Knowledge of Logicality Paradox 10 |
| 5.6 The Repeated Prisoner's Dilemma 10 |

| | 5.7 | The Centipede Game | 108 |
|---|---------|---|------|
| | 5.8 | CKR Fails Off the Backward Induction Path | 110 |
| | 5.9 | How to Play the Repeated Prisoner's Dilemma | 112 |
| | 5.10 | The Modal Logic of Knowledge | 114 |
| | 5.11 | Backward Induction and Extensive Form CKR | 115 |
| | 5.12 | Rationality and Extensive Form CKR | 118 |
| | 5.13 | On the Nonexistence of CKR | 119 |
| 6 | The Mi | xing Problem: Purification and Conjectures | 121 |
| | 6.1 | Why Play Mixed Strategies? | 121 |
| | 6.2 | Harsanyi's Purification Theorem | 123 |
| | 6.3 | A Reputational Model of Honesty and Corruption | 125 |
| | 6.4 | Purifying Honesty and Corruption | 128 |
| | 6.5 | Epistemic Games: Mixed Strategies as Conjectures | 128 |
| | 6.6 | Resurrecting the Conjecture Approach to Purification | 129 |
| 7 | Bayesia | n Rationality and Social Epistemology | 132 |
| | 7.1 | The Sexes: From Battle to Ballet | 133 |
| | 7.2 | The Choreographer Trumps Backward Induction | 134 |
| | 7.3 | Property Rights and Correlated Equilibrium | 135 |
| | 7.4 | Convention as Correlated Equilibrium | 136 |
| | 7.5 | Correlated Strategies and Correlated Equilibria | 136 |
| | 7.6 | Correlated Equilibrium and Bayesian Rationality | 138 |
| | 7.7 | The Social Epistemology of Common Priors | 139 |
| | 7.8 | The Social Epistemology of Common Knowledge | 141 |
| | 7.9 | Social Norms | 143 |
| | 7.10 | Game Theory and the Evolution of Norms | 143 |
| | 7.11 | The Merchants' Wares | 144 |
| 8 | Commo | on Knowledge and Nash Equilibrium | 146 |
| | 8.1 | Conditions for a Nash Equilibrium in Two-Player Games | 5146 |
| | 8.2 | A Three-Player Counterexample | 147 |
| | 8.3 | The Modal Logic of Common Knowledge | 149 |
| | 8.4 | The Commonality of Knowledge | 152 |
| | 8.5 | The Tactful Ladies | 153 |
| | 8.6 | The Tactful Ladies and the Commonality of Knowledge | 156 |
| | 8.7 | Agreeing to Disagree | 158 |
| | 8.8 | The Demise of Methodological Individualism | 161 |

x Contents

| 9 | Reflectiv | ve Reason and Equilibrium Refinements | 164 |
|----|-----------|--|-----|
| | 9.1 | Perfect, Perfect Bayesian, and Sequential Equilibria | 166 |
| | 9.2 | Incredible Threats | 167 |
| | 9.3 | Unreasonable Perfect Bayesian Equilibria | 170 |
| | 9.4 | The LBR criterion picks out the sequential equilibrium | 171 |
| | 9.5 | Selten's Horse: Sequentiality vs. the LBR criterion | 171 |
| | 9.6 | The Spence Signaling Model | 173 |
| | 9.7 | Irrelevant Node Additions | 174 |
| | 9.8 | Improper Sequential Equilibria | 175 |
| | 9.9 | Second-Order Forward Induction | 176 |
| | 9.10 | Beer and Quiche Without the Intuitive Criterion | 177 |
| | 9.11 | An Unreasonable Perfect Equilibrium | 178 |
| | 9.12 | The Principle of Insufficient Reason | 179 |
| | 9.13 | The Principle of Honest Communication | 179 |
| | 9.14 | Induction: Forward is Robust, Backward is Fragile | 180 |
| 10 | The Ana | alytics of Human Sociality | 181 |
| | 10.1 | Explaining Cooperation: An Overview | 181 |
| | 10.2 | Bob and Alice Redux | 183 |
| | 10.3 | The Folk Theorem | 185 |
| | 10.4 | The Folk Theorem with Imperfect Public Information | 188 |
| | 10.5 | Cooperation with Private Signaling | 193 |
| | 10.6 | One Cheer For the Folk Theorem | 195 |
| | 10.7 | Altruistic Punishing in the Public Goods Game | 197 |
| | 10.8 | The Failure of Models of Self-Regarding Cooperation | 200 |
| 11 | The Evo | olution of Property Rights | 201 |
| | 11.1 | The Endowment Effect | 201 |
| | 11.2 | Territoriality | 204 |
| | 11.3 | Property Rights in Young Children | 207 |
| | 11.4 | Respect for Possession in Nonhuman Animals | 207 |
| | 11.5 | Conditions for a Property Equilibrium | 210 |
| | 11.6 | Property and Antiproperty Equilibria | 213 |
| | 11.7 | An Antiproperty Equilibrium | 217 |
| | 11.8 | Property Rights as Choreographer | 220 |
| 12 | The Uni | ification of the Behavioral Sciences | 221 |
| | 12.1 | Gene-Culture Coevolution: The Biological Model | 223 |

| | 12.2 | Culture and Physiology of Human Communication | 228 | |
|------------|----------|--|-----|--|
| | 12.3 | Biological and Cultural Dynamics | 229 | |
| | 12.4 | The Theory of Norms: The Sociological Model | 231 | |
| | 12.5 | Socialization and the Internalization of Norms | 233 | |
| | 12.6 | Rational Choice: The Economic Model | 234 | |
| | 12.7 | Deliberative Choice: The Psychological Model | 236 | |
| | 12.8 | Application: Addictive Behavior | 238 | |
| | 12.9 | Game Theory: The Universal Lexicon of Life | 239 | |
| | 12.10 | Epistemic Game Theory and Social Norms | 240 | |
| | 12.11 | Society as a Complex Adaptive System | 242 | |
| | 12.12 | Counterpoint: Biology | 244 | |
| | 12.13 | Counterpoint: Economics | 245 | |
| | 12.14 | Counterpoint: Psychology | 245 | |
| | 12.15 | The Behavioral Disciplines Can Be Unified | 247 | |
| 13 | Summa | ry | 248 | |
| 14 | Table of | Symbols | 250 | |
| References | | | 253 | |
| Index | | | | |